Public Movement Multinational Georgia Election Observation Mission Final Report

The report has been produced with financial assistance of the "Open Society - Georgia" Foundation (in the framework of the project "Contribution to the conduct of more free and fair Parliamentary Elections in Georgia, particularly in Samtskhe-Javakheti, Kvemo Kartli, Kakheti, Shida Kartli and Mtskheta-Mtianeti regions through strengthening election observation efforts of the NGO "Public Movement Multinational Georgia") and the Embassy of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland to Georgia (in the framework of the project "Delivery of assistance in the conduction of more free and fair Parliamentary Elections in Georgia, particularly in the regions of minorities' compact settlement, through strengthening election observation efforts").

The contents of this publication are the sole responsibility of the Public Movement "Multinational Georgia" and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the "Open Society - Georgia" Foundation and the Embassy of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland to Georgia.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Executive summary
2. Methodology
3. Participation of national minorities
4. Election administration
5. Voters registration
6. Candidate registration
7. The election campaign
8. The media
9. Domestic and international observers
10. Voting, counting and Tabulation
11. Election day-related complaints and appeals 19
12. Recommendations
13. Election results
14. About the PMMG

1. Executive summary

For 1 October 2012 parliamentary elections PMMG has carried out two elections monitoring programs: a) Long term monitoring of the abuse of state resources (ASR) as well as monitoring of campaign finance in the selected areas of Samtskhe-Javakheti and Kvemo Kartli regions. The program has been realized by locally deployed 4 long term observers (LTM). b) Election Day observation mission in Samtskhe-Javakheti, Kvemo Kartli, Kakheti, Shida Kartli and Mtskheta-Mtianeti regions as well as conduction of post-election monitoring of complaints and appeals in the underlined regions. The program targeted Samtskhe-Javakheti, Kvemo Kartli, Kakheti, Shida Kartli and Mtskheta-Mtianeti regions with 90% of the areas where minorities compose over 30% of the population. The program has been realized by 2 Central Election Commission (CEC) observers; 17 Electoral District (ED) observers; 340 Electoral Precinct (EP) observers and 69 mobile group observers. Total – 428 observers.

Despite the presence of electoral shortcomings identified and challenged by the short term observers (STOs) on the Election Day at preparatory, ballot-casting and vote counting phases, PMMG concludes that the electoral process was in consistence with the stated norms of transparency and fairness which have allowed the voters representing national minority population of the country to make own political choice in a competitive environment.

The parliament of Georgia is elected according to a mixed system, for 4 year term. 77 members of Parliament are elected under a list-based proportional system in one nationalwide constituency and another 73 are elected in 73 single-mandate constituencies. Georgian electoral legislation does not require single-mandate constituencies to be of equal or comparable size. The elections were administered by 3 tired election administrations: the Central Election Commission (CEC), 73 District Election Commissions (DECs) and over 3 500 Precinct Election Commissions (PECs).

According to the data provided by the CEC 62 115 local and 1 641 international observers, more than 33 000 representatives of electoral subjects and 3 295 media representatives monitored the polling process. More than 47 thousand commission members were serving the voters. Hot line, online chat and online operator of Central Election Commission were working for 24 hour a day. Briefings in the CEC were held in every two hours starting from 9:00 am in the morning. The CEC systematically provided the public with the information regarding the voter's turnout and about the polling process.

Majority of registered political parties and election blocks nominated candidates belonging to national minorities. Based on the data provided by the CEC all the registered political parties as well as election blocks included the representatives of national minorities in their proportional party list and in the list of majoritarian candidates. However, the largest number of representatives of national minorities were nominated by "United National Movement – More Benefits to People" (13), "Labor Council of Georgia" (12), "Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream" (12) and Political Union "kakha Kukava-Free Georgia" (9 candidates).

As a result of the Parliamentary Elections 3 members (from the list of "Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream") of the Parliament representing national minorities have been elected through proportional

election system, while 3 members (representing "United National Movement – More Benefits to People") representing national minorities have been elected through majoritarian election system. Therefore, in total 6 representatives of national minorities have become the members of the Parliament.

As compared with previous years the election administration has devoted considerable attention to the issue of national minorities. The CEC has created a special working group on the facilitation and promotion of electoral process for the voters belonging to national minorities. Within the framework of the working group CEC has conducted various types of voters' educational programs for minority voters. In addition, CEC has translated the following set of electoral documents into minority languages: a) the manual (guide) for the members of PEC (Georgian-Armenian-Russian and Georgian-Azerbaijanian-Russian); b) the instructions for the chairperson of PEC (Georgian-Azerbaijanian and Georgian-Armenian); c) the instructions for the members of PEC (Georgian-Azerbaijanian and Georgian-Armenian); d) the flyers for the voters (Georgian-Azerbaijanian and Georgian-Armenian); e) the data of voters belonging to national minorities as included in the Unified Voters List. CEC has delivered series of training program (3 series) for the members of election administration belonging to national minority groups. The training program has been delivered selectively in Russian, Azerbaijanian and Armenian languages.

CEC has created a special section "Ethnic Minorities" on its website hosting the information in Armenian and Azerbaijanian languages. CEC has also offered the opportunities to minority representatives to be widely represented in the election administrations. According to the data obtained from CEC the number of the members of PECs belonging to national minorities accounted for 2 774 people: 1 241 members of PECs with ethnic Azerbiajanian background and 1 533 members of PECs with ethnic Armenian background.

Several political parties and election blocks including "United National Movement", Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream", Election Block "Giorgi Targamadze-Christian Democratic Union" and Political Union "New Rights" have been engaged in minority regions to deliver the main messages to the local voters. However, the most active party in election campaigning was "United National Movement", followed by Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream" and Election Block "Giorgi Targamadze-Christian Democratic Union". It has to be noted that all the mentioned political parties maintained offices in most of the districts densely populated by national minority groups. As for the rest of the political parties and election blocks they did not effectively engage in minority regions claiming the shortage of financial resources and well as the obstacles created by the local authorities. However, some representatives of several opposition parties visited minority regions during the election campaign.

While all the registered political parties and election blocks included the representatives of national minorities in their proportional party list as well as in the list of majoritarian candidates only few of them addressed the needs and constraints of national minorities and thus incorporated in their political programs. Only "United National Movement", Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream", Election Block "Giorgi Targamadze-Christian Democratic Union" and Political Union "New Rights" have touched upon the issues of protection and promotion of national minorities' rights and interests in the political platforms. However, despite this progress the scope as well as intensity of coverage of national minorities' genuine challenges was not still satisfactory. Almost all programs

contained general wording regarding the promotion of minorities' interests without proposing clear, straightforward and reliable solutions how to address the persisting needs and constraints.

In general, the election campaign in Kvemo Kartli and Samtskhe-Javakheti regions were taking place in a highly polarized environment. The main forms of campaign activity have been relatively small-scale events and gatherings, rather than large-scale rallies. Only "United National Movement" and Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream" held large scale rallies especially in big regional centers such as Rustavi and Akhaltsikhe. Campaign billboards were particularly in evidence in Tbilisi and some other big towns in the regions, mostly for "United National Movement". Most opposition parties claimed they did not have equal access to commercial billboards, asserting that all billboards spaces had been reserved in advance by the "United National Movement" and that the prices of billboards for political advertising were being set high.

The election campaign was accompanied by widespread allegations of intimidation, among others of candidates, party activists, state employs, students and ordinary local population. Among numerous specific allegations examined by the PMMG several turned out to be credible. These included a number of verified cases of pressure on opposition supporters by local authorities to desist from campaigning. Teachers, medical doctors and students in particular were subjected to such forms of pressure. There were a number of verified cases of threats by school principles and the officials of "United National Movement" to teachers that they would lose their jobs if they continued to work for opposition parties.

The attempt of pressure on PMMG long term observer was reported in Marneuli municipality from the side of local high official in a course of attempt to obtain additional information on the identified fact of abuse of administrative resources.

The distinction between state and party has been frequently blurred in Samtskhe-Javakheti and Kvemo Kartly reigons. Some cases have been reported according to which social programs of the local authorities were at times combined with the campaign activities of the "United National Movement". Moreover, there were frequently reported cases of state officials conducting official duties and combining them with campaigning together with "United National Movement's" majoritarian candidates.

Given the findings as obtained by the short term observers (STO) PMMG concludes that the STOs generally have carried out observation mission without restrictions at any stage of the electoral precinct's operation including preparatory, ballot-casting and vote counting process. One case has been reported when the STO was warned by the Chair of the electoral precinct. There was an instance where the STO was not allowed into the electoral precinct (# 53 EP of # 21 Gardabani ED) to carry out his assigned duties. However, later on he was permitted to observe the EP.

Election Day was generally calm and the operation of EPs including preparatory, ballot-casting and vote counting process have proceeded without restrictions. However, some instances of procedural violations have been identified especially during an opening of EPs and voting casting stage. In total PMMG observers: a) raised 77 verbal objections and filled out respective number of incident forms; b) filed and submitted 48 complaints to the respective EPs; filed and submitted 9 appeals to the ED. Moreover,

PMMG lawyers have filed and submitted 2 appeals to the CEC as well as 4 appeals to the courts. It has to be noted that most of the appeals and complaints filed by the observers as well as the lawyers responded to the following major types of electoral shortcomings: a) Attempts to influence the voting; b) Violation of marking procedures; c) Some electoral shortcomings which have hindered preparatory and ballot-casting process; d) Shortage of ballot papers delivered at EPs has been a systematic violation; e) More than one voter entering the election booth has acquired systematic nature.

2. Methodology

The present report is entirely based on the findings obtained by the PMMG as a result of realization of 2 election monitoring programs:

- A) Long term monitoring (May-September) of the abuse of state resources (ASR) such as financial resources, institutional resources, regulatory resources and enforcement resources as well as monitoring of campaign finance. The program has been carried out in Samtskhe-Javakheti region and focused on Ninotsminda, Akhalkalaki and Tsalka districts as well as in Kvemo Kartli region with the focus on Marneuli, Bolnisi and Dmanisi districts. The program has been realized by the locally deployed 4 long term observers: two observers engaged in each region.
- B) Election Day observation mission in Samtskhe-Javakheti, Kvemo Kartli, Kakheti, Shida Kartli and Mtskheta-Mtianeti regions as well as conduction of post-election monitoring of complaints and appeals in the underlined regions. The program targeted Samtskhe-Javakheti, Kvemo Kartli, Kakheti, Shida Kartli and Mtskheta-Mtianeti regions with 90% of the areas where minorities compose over 30% of the population. The program has been realized by 2 CEC observers; 17 ED observers; 340 EP observers and 69 mobile group observers. Total 428 observers.

PMMG assessed compliance of the election process with OSCE "Existing Commitments for Democratic Elections in OSCE Participating States", "Code of Good Practice in Electoral Materials" (Venice Commission), "Copenhagen Document", and other international standards for democratic elections and Georgian legislation.

PMMG is grateful to "Open Society Georgian Foundation" (OSGF) for the delivery of financial support for the implementation of program A as well as to the National Democratic Institute (NDI), OSGF and British Embassy for offering financial assistance for the implementation of program B. PMMG also wishes to express its appreciation to its partner organizations Transparency International (TI), International Society for Democracy and Fair Elections (ISFED), Georgian Young Lawyers' Association (GYLA), its regional partners as well as to foreign missions for their co-operation throughout the observation period.

3. Participation of national minorities

National minorities accounts for 16.2 per cent of Georgia's population. Eethnic Azerbaijanians (6.5

per cent) and ethnic Armenians (5.7 per cent) represent the largest minority groups densely populated in Kvemo Kartli and Samtskhe-Javakheti region respectively. There are some minority groups such as Russians, Ossetians, Greeks, Chechens, Jews, Abkhazians and Kurds.

According to the domestic legislation including the Constitution, national minorities are granted the right to fully participate in political process and be elected. Georgia has joined most of the human rights conventions including the "Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities" setting a legal framework for the protection and realization of their rights. Despite some progress attained in the field of minorities' protection, country lacks an inclusive legal framework to fully protect and realize their rights. Georgia has not yet adopted any special regulations which would facilitate the promotion of higher qualitative and quantitative political participation and adequate representation of minorities in political domain.

Majority of registered political parties and election blocks nominated candidates belonging to national minorities. Based on the data provided by the CEC the following parties and blocks included the representatives of national minorities in their party list and the list of majoritarian deputies:

- 1. Political Union "Kakha Kukava-Free Georgia": 5 candidates included in the proportional list (assigned number on the list (AN): 15, 16, 59, 60 and 120); 4 majoritarian candidates (Marneuli, Akhalkalaki, Ninotsminda and Senaki Election Districts (EDs))
- 2. "National Democratic Party": 6 candidates included in the proportional list (AN: 8, 34, 91, 108, 123 and 141); no majoritarian candidates
- 3. "United National Movement-More Benefits to People": 10 candidates included in the proportional list (AN: 39, 41, 50, 84, 87, 94, 102, 113, 114, and 126); 3 majoritarian candidates (Marneuli, Akhalkalaki and Ninotsminda EDs)
- 4. "Justice for Georgia": 5 candidates included in the proportional list (AN: 2, 8, 71, 76 and 114); no majoritarian candidates
- 5 "Public Movement": 5 candidates included in the proportional list (AN: 26, 66, 68, 94 and 104); no majoritarian candidates
- 6. "Freedom-The Way of Zviad Gamsakhurdia": 1 candidate included in the proportional list (AN: 87); no majoritarian candidates
- 7. Political Union "Jondi Baghaturia Georgian Group": 1 candidate included in the proportional list (AN: 86); no majoritarian candidates
- 8. Political Union "New Rights": 3 candidates included in the proportional list (AN: 16, 17 and 104); 3 majoritarian candidates (Marneuli, Akhalkalaki and Ninotsminda EDs)
- 9. "People's Party": 1 candidate included in the proportional list (AN: 68); no majoritarian candidates
- 10. "Merab Kostava Society": 2 candidates included in the proportional list (AN: 31 and 40); no majoritarian candidates
- 11. "Future Georgia": 7 candidates included in the proportional list (AN: 20, 80, 86, 99, 102, 105 and 106); no majoritarian candidates
- 12. "Labor Council of Georgia": 11 candidates included in the proportional list (AN: 3, 62, 77, 78,

- 82, 83, 88, 90, 95, 99 and 118); 1 majoritarian candidate (Akhalkalaki ED)
- 13. "Shalva Natelashvili Labor Party of Georgia": 4 candidates included in the proportional list (AN: 32, 33, 79 and 98); 2 majoritarian candidates (Gardabani and Marneuli EDs)
- 14. "Georgian Sportsmen's Community": 8 candidates included in the proportional list (AN: 28, 29, 31, 41, 44, 62, 97 and 109); no majoritarian candidates
- 15. Election Block "Giorgi Targamadze Christian Democratic Union": 2 candidates included in the proportional list (AN: 14 and 15); 2 majoritarian candidates (Marneuli and Lentekhi EDs).
- 16. Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili Georgian Dream": 7 candidates included in the proportional list (AN: 36, 38, 56, 87, 155, 157 and 170); 5 majoritarian candidates (Marneuli, Tsalka, Kareli, Akhalkalaki and Ninotsminda EDs).

As can be seen all political parties as well as election blocks included the representatives of national minorities in their proportional party list and in the list of majoritarian candidates. However, the largest number of representatives of national minorities were nominated by "United National Movement – More Benefits to People" (13 candidates) followed by "Labor Council of Georgia" (12), "Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream" (12) and Political Union "kakha Kukava-Free Georgia" (9).

4. Election administration

General scope of activities related to the needs of minority voters

In May, 2012 CEC has created a special working group on the facilitation and promotion of electoral process for the voters belonging to national minorities. The group includes the whole range of public bodies, civil societal, international, donor and media organizations as well as CSOs dealing with minority issues – total 19 organizations.

The working group has developed an action plan for 2012 stipulating the realization of the following objectives: a) ensuring equal electoral rights for national minorities; b) informing young voters and promotion of their adequate participation in the elections; c) informing female voters and promotion of their adequate participation in the elections; d) informing the votes with disabilities and promotion of their adequate participation in the elections; e) organization of the meetings with media organizations; f) informing the members of the Council on National Minorities at the Public Defender's Office of Georgia; g) translation of election materials into the minority languages.

To this end the working group has embarked on the implementation of the following set of activities: a) conduction of trainings-seminars for youths, women and people with disabilities on electoral rules and procedures; b) conduction of mock elections (simulation of the Election Day); c) informing local population with the engagement of youths and female leaders through the dissemination of electoral booklets and flyers; d) delivery of electoral education to upper grade high school students; e) organization of the visits of youths to the CEC; f) dissemination of elections related video spots with sign language translation; g) development and dissemination of educational materials; h) development

of the special manual for the members of PEC how to treat people with disabilities on the Election Day; i) adaptation of the polling stations to the needs of the mentioned vulnerable groups. During summer the working group has conducted 5 working meetings in Tbilisi as well as organized 3 field visits in the regions: Kvemo Kartli: Marneuli; Samtskhe-Javakheti: Akhalkalaki and Kakheti: village Karajala, Telavi.

Informational provision of the members of election administration as well as voters belonging to national minority groups:

CEC has translated the following set of electoral documents for the voters belonging to national minorities: a) the manual (guide) for the members of PEC (Georgian-Armenian-Russian and Georgian-Azerbaijanian-Russian); b) the instructions for the chairperson of PEC (Georgian-Azerbaijanian and Georgian-Armenian); c) the instructions for the members of PEC (Georgian-Azerbaijanian and Georgian-Armenian); d) the flyers for the voters (Georgian-Azerbaijanian and Georgian-Armenian); e) the data of voters belonging to national minorities as included in the Unified Voters List.

CEC has conducted a series of training program (3 series) for the members of PEC in minority areas. The training program has been delivered selectively in Russian, Azerbaijanian and Armenian languages.

According to the request of CEC (placed order) since August 15 the Public Broadcaster of Georgia (PBG) was translating and airing 6 minute long "Election Televised Digest" in Armenian and Azerbaijanian languages. Moreover, the PBG was airing "National News", "Election Televised Digest" and CEC elections related video spots according to the following schedule: a) 07:00 – PBG first channel, in Armenian and Azerbaijanian languages; b) 07:00 – PBG third channel (ΠИК), in Armenian language; c) 24:00 – PBG second channel, in Armenian and Azerbaijanian languages; d) 22:00 – Marneuli TV company "Marneuli TV" – Azerbaijanian language; e) 23:00 – Bolnisi TV company "Bolneli" – in Azerbaijanian language; f) 07:00 – Akhaltsikhe TV company "Channel 9" – in Armenian language; g) 07:00 – Akhalkalaki TV company "ATV-12" – in Armenian language; h) 07:00 – Ninotsminda TV company "Farvana" – in Armenian language; i) 07:00 – GPB First Radio Station – in Armenian and Azerbaijanian languages.

PBG organized 2 televised debates among the political subjects which have been eventually translated into Armenian and Azerbaijanian languages and disseminated through regional televisions.

CEC has created a special section "Ethnic Minorities" on its website hosting the following set of information in Armenian and Azerbaijanian languages: the manual for the members of PEC; voters' flyers; promotional video spots as well as the information of the working group on national minorities. For the Election Day the CEC has specially opened a Hot Line in order to timely deliver the useful electoral information to the voters. In case of necessity it was supposed to deliver the informational support in Georgian, Armenian and Azerbaijanian languages.

Number of Electoral Precincts (EP) with the compacts settlements of national minorities in the respective Electoral Districts (ED)

Taking into consideration the density of national minorities the CEC has opened 337 EPs in 12 EDs:

1) # 11 Sagarejo ED (Iormuganlo): 12 EP; 2) # 15 Lagodekhi ED (Kabali): 6 EP; 3) # 17 Telavi ED (Karajala): 4 EP; 4) # 21 Gardabani ED: 32 EP; 5) #22 Marneuli ED: 81 EP; 6) # 23 Bolnisi ED: 42 EP; 7) 24 Dmanisi ED: 32 EP; 8) # 25 Tsalka ED: 16 EP; 9) # 26 Tetritskaro ED: 5 EP; 10) # 37 Akhaltsikhe ED: 8 EP; 11) # 40 Akhalkalaki ED: 63 EP; 12) # 41 Ninotsminda ED: 36 EP.

Ethnic composition of election administration

According to the data as obtained from CEC the number of the members of PECs belonging to national minorities accounted for 2 774 people.

Members of the PECs in the respective ED with ethnic Azerbaijanian background were distributed according to the following composition: # 11 Sagarejo ED: 38 PEC members; # 15 Lagodekhi ED: 6 PEC members; # 17 Telavi ED: 20 PEC members; # 21 Gardabani ED: 100 PEC members; # 22 Marneuli ED: 584 PEC members; # 23 Bolnisi ED: 251 PEC members; # 24 Dmanisi ED: 218 PEC members; # 25 Tsalka ED: 24 PEC members – total 1 241 members of PECs with ethnic Azerbiajanian ethnic background.

Members of the PECs in the respective ED with ethnic Armenian background were distributed according to the following composition: # 21 Gardabani ED: 5 PEC members; # 22 Marneuli ED: 87 PEC members; # 23 Bolnisi ED: 31 PEC members; # 25 Tsalka ED: 140 PEC members; # 37 Akhaltsikhe ED: 92 PEC members; # 40 Akhalkalaki ED: 797 PEC members; # 41 Ninotsminda ED: 381 PEC members – total 1 533 members of PEC with ethnic Armenian background.

5. Voters registration

On November 15, 2011 President Saakashvili signed a decree setting up of a state-funded Voters List Verification Commission (VLVC). The VLVC was a part of the electoral system reform deal signed by the ruling party and several opposition parties. Six opposition parties have refused to join the deal, citing that it was failing to secure fair electoral system. 14 members of the commission were the representatives from the political parties, including seven of them from the ruling party "United National Movement".

Each of the following parties had one representative in the commission: Christian-Democratic Movement (CDM), a leading party of the small parliamentary minority group; New Rights Party; Industry Will Save Georgia; National-Democratic Party; Georgia's European Democrats (formerly On Our Own party); Democratic Party of Georgia; Christian-Democratic People's Party. An opposition representative will be elected as a chairperson of the commission. Seven members of the commission were representatives of non-governmental organizations, among them election observer group New Generation-New Initiative (nGnI). PMMG has declined to join the commission.

According to the amendment to the election code, the voters list, approved by the commission after rechecking process and submitted to CEC would represent unified list of voters.

On August 1st, 2012 CEC of Georgia received Unified Voters' List from the Chair of the Commission for Ensuring the Accuracy of Voters' List. Mamuka Katsitadze handed the electronic version of the

list to the CEC Chair, Zurab Kharatishvili. Data of voters was reflected in the list as of July 31st, 2012.

VLVC checked 3.483,142 voters via "door to door" efforts. As the chairperson of the commission Mamuka Katsitadze has said, 25,949 voters were discovered to be dead, 291,871 voters are abroad, 132,156 are removed from the registered address, 649,839 voters are in internal migration, they could not contact 183,621 voters. VLVC has continued to work for the verification of the list until September 1. The list verification process has finished by September 15.

However, some controversies existed regarding the accuracy of the Unified Voters' List. Coalition Georgian Dream urged CEC to remove so-called "inscribed" voters from the unified voters' list. Zakaria Kutsnashvili, representative of Coalition said that there were 189,000 "inscribed" voters in the list, who would not have a right to vote. Kutsnashvili accused the government of attempting to legally rig elections.

Kutsnashvili, believed that the Parliament of Georgia should have adopted amendments to the election code of Georgia. According to him the person, who has had his registration nullified under the request of an owner of an apartment and the decision of the Ministry of Justice, should not be included in the list of the voters with the previous address of registration. The number of such voters currently is 189,000. Moreover, as Kutsnashvili stated voters, who have sold their houses and have not been nullified their registration address they must vote according to a current address or undergo registration with the consent of current owners. In addition, as the coalition representative stated in case voter has no current place of residence, or the new owner refuses to register him at their places of residence, he/she should undergo registration in the public register offices of the cities or regions and take the status of the voters without registered address.

Several other CSOs including League of Voters expressed doubt about the accuracy of the voters list.

6. Candidate registration

According to the data provided by the CEC the following political parties as well as election blocks were registered for the Parliamentary Elections of October 1, 2012:

Political parties, Registered for the Parliamentary Elections of October 1, 2012

- 1. Political Union "Kakha Kukava-free Georgia" assigned number (AN): 1
- 2. "National Democratic Party"- AN: 4
- 3. "United National Movement-More Benefits to People"-AN: 5
- 4. "Justice for Georgia" AN: 9
- 5. "Public Movement" AN: 17
- 6. "Freedom-The Way of Zviad Gamsakhurdia" AN: 19
- 7. Political Union "Jondi Baghaturia Georgian Group" AN: 23
- 8. Political Union "New Rights" AN:24

- 9. "People's Party" AN: 26
- 10. "Merab Kostava Society" AN: 30
- 11. "Future Georgia" AN: 35
- 12. "Labor Council of Georgia" AN: 36
- 13. "Shalva Natelashvili Labor Party of Georgia" AN: 38
- 14. "Georgian Sportsmen's Community" AN: 40

Election Blocs, Registered for the Parliamentary Elections of October 1, 2012

1. "Giorgi Targamadze – Christian Democratic Union" – AN: 10

Parties united in the block:

- "Christian Democratic Movement"
- "European Democrats of Georgia"
- 2. "Bidzina Ivanishvili Georgian Dream" AN 41

Parties united in the block:

- Political Union "Georgian Dream Democratic Georgia"
- "Conservative Party of Georgia"
- Political Movement "Industry Will Save Georgia"
- "Republican Party of Georgia"
- Political Union "Our Georgia Free Democrats"
- Political Union "National Forum

7. The election campaign

As compared with previously held elections the monitoring program has revealed an increased interest on the part of political parties and election blocks to devote an attention to minorities' issues and interethnic relations in a course of election campaign. The language of campaigning was selectively applied in minority regions by the political parties and candidates to properly communicate with the local voters.

Several political parties and election blocks including "United National Movement", Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream", Election Block "Giorgi Targamadze-Christian Democratic Union" and Political Union "New Rights" were engaged in minority regions to deliver the main messages to the local voters.

However, the most active party in election campaigning was "United National Movement", followed by Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream" and Election Block "Giorgi Targamadze-Christian Democratic Union". It has to be noted that all the mentioned political parties maintained offices in most districts densely populated by national minority groups. As for the rest of the political parties and blocks they did not effectively engage in minority regions claiming the shortage of financial resources and well as the obstacles created by the local authorities. However, some representatives of several opposition parties visited minority regions during an election campaign.

While all the registered political parties and election blocks included the representatives of national minorities in their proportional party list as well as in the list of majoritarian candidates only few of them addressed the needs and constraints of national minorities and thus incorporated in their political programs. Only "United National Movement", Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream", Election Block "Giorgi Targamadze-Christian Democratic Union" and Political Union "New Rights" have touched upon the issues of protection and promotion of national minorities' rights and interests in the political platforms. However, despite this progress the scope as well as intensity of coverage of national minorities' genuine challenges was not still satisfactory. Almost all programs contained general wording regarding the promotion of minorities' interests without proposing clear, straightforward and reliable solutions how to address the persisting needs and interests of vulnerable groups.

In general, the election campaign in Kvemo Kartli and Samtskhe-Javakheti regions were taking place in a highly polarized environment.

The main forms of campaign activity were relatively small-scale events and gatherings, rather than large-scale rallies. Only "United National Movement" and Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream" were holding large scale rallies especially in big regional centers such as Rustavi and Akhaltsikhe.

Campaign billboards were particularly in evidence in Tbilisi and some other big towns in the regions, mostly for "United National Movement". Most opposition parties claimed they did not have equal access to commercial billboards, complaining that all billboard spaces had been reserved in advance by the "United National Movement" and that the prices of billboards for political advertising were being set high.

The election campaign was accompanied by widespread allegations of intimidation, among others of candidates, party activists, state employs, students and ordinary local population. Among numerous specific allegations examined by the PMMG several turned out to be credible. These included a number of verified cases of pressure on opposition supporters by local authorities to desist from campaigning. Teachers, medical doctors and students in particular were subjected to such forms of pressure. There were a number of verified cases of threats by school principles and the officials of "United National Movement" to teachers that they would lose their jobs if they continued to work for opposition parties.

In Adigeny, Samtskhe-Javakheti region the activists of Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream" were being warned to refrain from its support. Moreover, the local authorities have been impeding the conduction of opposition gatherings. Local authorities in Adigeni, particularly the police were forcing local business elite not to cooperate with the Block and consequently not to rent the premises for the opening of local office.

Before the commencement of mass rally organized by Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream" in Rustavi on August 19 Mikheil Tsikarishvili, supporter of the Block has been detained by the police based on the false accusations as his relatives and Block representatives complained. The detainee was kept in the local police office under the pressure, intimidation and harassment and has been release in the morning next day.

The resident of Marneuli, Kvemo Kartli region Abesalom Kuchashvili, supporter of Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream" has been intimidated and harassed by the local police. He was warned to refrain from the support of the Block otherwise he would be imprisoned.

The number of punished students wearing the T-Shirts of Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream" was rising in Kvemo kartli region. Some facts were reported according to which the students have been intimidated and pressured by school principles for wearing Blocks' T-Shorts. For example, the student (who did not want his name to be identified) of Rustavi # 8 public school has been punished – he was forcibly taken by the school ranger to the principal (Ketevan Khvadagiani) who stripped off the student T-Short and threw it away.

In a course of preparation for the meeting envisaged to be held by Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream" with the local voters in Mernuli Culture House on 14 May, the local activists have been escorted by the police cars creating discomfort for proper preparation for the event.

On 14 May, supporter of Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream" Omar Kharaishvili has been threatened to be imprisoned by Shalva Kupraishvili, Head of Village Tsereteli and Saimerlo authority for his support to the Block.

The attempt of pressure on PMMG long term observer was reported in Marneuli municipality from the side of local high official in a course of attempt to obtain additional information on the identified fact of abuse of administrative resources.

In the beginning of June Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream" opened the office in Akhalkalaki rented from Melikh Raisian. Soon after the opening of the office Mr. Raisian left Georgia. The very next day Ministry of Internal Affairs of Georgian released the news according to which Mr. Raisian was pursued. Moreover, Giorgi Mkhchian, close relative of Mr. Raisian, who has performed some financial operations for Mr. Raisian and simultaneously worked as his driver as well as chaired the local initiative group of the Block has been detained on June 23 at 23:00 for the "illegal appropriation of state property". The case of Raisian is handed over to the INTERPOL and he is currently chased on the bases of court judgment according to which he is sentenced for 6 year imprisonment.

Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream" has attempted to open an office in Ninotsminda. Representatives of the Block have offered higher remuneration to the owners of the premises. However, no office space has been appropriated to the Block possibly because of the massive pressure and intimidation imposed on the owners from the side of local authorities. It has been reported that one of the local dwellers has agreed to rent out the office space. However, on the same day his farther was arrested for "illegal possession of the weapon", while his son's shop has been put under the arrest

for not paying taxes. After one week the farther was released. Rumor has been disseminated among the local population according to which every local dweller would face the similar consequences if he/she tries to support the opposition and offer the premises for office rent.

On June 15, local representatives of Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream" in Akhalkalaki have addressed the communication company LTD "Silknet" to obtain phone and internet service. Representatives of the company commenced the works which have not been finalized due to the "lack of enough space" on the internet distribution block. Despite the promise to eradicate the problem within a shorter period of time, no progress has been achieved during 2 months. Representatives of the Block blamed the company for not providing internet connection and considered the case politically motivated due to the fact that the company belongs to the person closely affiliated with the government.

Ia Taktakidze, Doctor-Endocrinologist has been dismissed from the job (hospital in Ninotsminda) due to her political activity. She has been fired soon after the opening of the office of Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream" in Akhalkalaki in where Ms. Taktakidze has paid visits as a supporter of opposition. Initially Ms. Taktakidze has been warned by the high officials of local authority and the administration of the hospital. Through her friend she has been warned to refrain from political activities otherwise she would lose her job. Later on, Ms. Taktakidze was dismissed from her job as her husband continued to cooperate with the Block.

Mr. Azat Shipaktsian, the active member of the Election Block "Bidzina Ivanishvili-Georgian Dream" in Akhalkalaki has received the warning according to which his wife working in the local hospital would lose her job if he would not refrain from political activities. Ms. Shipaktsian was forced to take "forced leave" since her husband continued political activities.

The distinction between state and party is frequently blurred in Samtskhe-Javakheti and Kvemo Kartly regions. There were some cases according to which social programs of the local authorities were at times combined with the campaign activities of the "United National Movement". For example, large scale public events (concerts, theatrical performances etc) were taking place in Georgian spoke villages of Akhalkalaki financing of which have not been identified in the local budget. Moreover, completion time of several large scale projects in Akhalkalaki has been coincided with the election period including the repairmen of roofs on the resident buildings located in the territory of former military town.

Moreover, there were frequently reported verified cases of state officials conducting official duties and combining them with campaigning together with a "United National Movement's" majoritarian candidates. For example On June 23, Gigi Tsereteli, Deputy Head of the Parliament met with the local voters in Village Tsereteli, Kvemo Kartli region. He was accompanied by David Kirkitadze, Governor of Kvemo kartli region, Zaza Dekanoidze, Head of Marneuli Municipality, Shalva Kuprashvili, Head of Authority of Village Tsereteli and Saimerlo, as well as by other officials representing local authority. Followed by the meeting Mr. Tsereteli together with the representatives of local authorities has opened the newly constructed church in the bordering village Saimerlo. It has to be noted that the local budget envisaged only the erection of the fence around the church. It is not still clear whether the construction of the church has been commenced in accordance with the request of the local population.

8. The media

There are several locally operated media sources in Samtskhe-Javakheti and Kvemo Kartli regions a) Merneuli TV company "Marneuli TV" (Kvemo Kartli region); b) Bolnisi TV company "Bolneli" (Kvemo Kartli region); c) Akhaltsikhe TV company "Channel 9" (Samtskhe-Javakheti region) and d) Akhalkalaki TV company "ATV-12" (Samtskhe-Javakheti region) and e) Ninotsminda TV company "Farvana".

The local media sources were the major provider of news and information to the local population in conjunction with Georgian Public Broadcaster, Rustavi 2, Imedi TV and Mze having a national wide outreach. TV Company Kavkasia covers only Tbilisi and is not accessible to the population in the mentioned regions. Moreover, opposition leaning TV Companies Meastro and Channel 9 were only accessible through the satellite dishes in the regions as far as local cable TV companies (if any) did not disseminate the signal.

9. Domestic and international observers

CEC has introduced changes to the instructions of registration of international observer organizations and international observers at the CEC for observing the elections. According to newly introduced changes for registration purposes international organization should provide statue envisaging observation of elections, protection of human rights and conduction of activities based on internationally acknowledged principles: a) respect to legislation of Georgia, sovereignty and international norms of HR, b) refrain from hindering to election process, c) political impartiality, d) financial independence from participants of election process and transparency of financial resources, e) adherence to the provisions acknowledged by the declaration of principles for international observation of elections.

Introduction of new changes to the registration instructions has been challenged by some local CSOs as well as representatives of political parties claiming that the new regulation has been deliberately adopted to impede the conduction of observation mission by some observing organizations having critical attitude towards the authorities or might be somehow associated with the opposition political parties or election blocks.

According to the official data CEC rejected registering the "Public Chamber of the Russian Federation", Foundation "Kenesary Khan" as well as "Transparency International – Latvia" (as far as the functional mandate of TI Latvia stipulates the fight against corruption not the conduction of elections monitoring program) to monitor the Parliamentary Elections.

Moreover, CEC has also rejected registering 6 domestic organizations to monitor the elections: "Unanimous for Societal Rights", "New Generation for Democratic Georgia", "Caucasus Synergy", "Georgian Society for the Protection of Human and Prisoner's Rights", "Imerety Regional Union for the Protection of Georgian Democratic Principles and Human Rights" and "Belief of Justice".

As of September 30, 2012, 62 115 local observers were registered by the CEC to carry out the Election observation program for the upcoming Parliamentary elections. As for the international observers CEC has registered 1 641 people to carry out elections observation mission.

The main domestic observer organizations were the International Society for Fair and Elections and Democracy (ISFED), the Georgian Young Lawyers' Association (GYLA), Transparency International Georgia (TI), New Generation New Initiative (NGNI) as well as Public Movement Multinational Georgia (PMMG). However, PMMG was the major local NGO which has conducted Election Day monitoring program in the areas densely populated with national minority groups. However, in a course of conduction of the program, PMMG has closely cooperated with the underlined organizations and coordinated activities prior to the Election Day and on the Election Day as well.

10. Voting, counting and Tabulation

Setting up of electoral precincts

The vast majority of EPs observed have opened at time as established by the law. There has been a single case where the electoral precinct was opened with a delay - # 49 EP of # 23 Bolnisi ED was not ready to receive voters by 8:00.

In general, all EPs had all the necessary electoral materials as well as inventory to conduct the ballot-casting process in an appropriate manner consistent with the established legal requirements. However, STOs have revealed some inconsistencies in the preparatory phase. STO noted instance where the EP did not have the electoral materials consistent with established sample by the law including the seal of the Precinct Electoral Commission (PEC) (# 40 EP of # 21 Gardabani ED).

Some cases have been identified where the overall number of voters in the general list of the EP significantly exceeded the number of bulletins handed over to the PEC (this type of electoral violation has been revealed at #85 EP of # 22 Marneuli ED, # 5 EP of # 22 Marneuli ED, # 67 EP of # 40 Akhalkalaki ED, # 18 EP of # 41 Ninotsminda ED, # 24 EP of # 24 Dmanisi ED, # 44 EP of # 11 Sagarejo ED, # 4 EP of # 22 Marneuli ED).

In general, EP's opening procedures have been conducted according to the election legislation. However, some instances have been reported where the procedures have been carried out with some violations. Such cases included the fact when the functions to be performed by the members of the PEC has not been allocated by secrete casting (# 46 EP of # 11 Sagarejo ED). Moreover, there has been a case of not filling out of the control sheet according to the standing electoral procedure (# 21 EP of # 24 Dmanisi ED). One case has been reported by the STO where the PEC's and register's seals have not been specially marked (damaged) at setting up of electoral precinct (# 49 EP of # 23 Bolnisi ED) as stipulated by the election law.

As noted by the STOs in almost all the electoral precincts conditions for the confidentiality have been maintained.

Ballot casting and closing of the electoral precincts

STOs noted that at all EPs registers have asked the voters to present the document confirming an identity of the person. One case has been reported where the voter has tried to cast a vote by the

driver's license. However, PEC has denied the voter to get registered and vote despite the presence of different view expressed by the Chairman of the PEC.

At all EPs the voters used to put signature in the register' table list alongside his/her name and surname. There was a single case in # 24 EP of # 24 Dmanisi ED according to which 3 voters voted without being registered in the general voters' list.

Few cases have been reported by the STOs where the member of the PEC as well as the persons having the right to be present at the EP helped the voter in casting a vote including inside the voting booth - observer has reported few cases when the member of PEC as well as observers have assisted the voters in casting a vote in # 55 EP of # 23 Bolnisi ED.

One of the procedural violations revealed by the STOs concerned inking safeguards. There was a case where the STO at # 55 Electoral Precinct of # 23 Bolnisi ED willingly asked the member of PEC to apply inking just to check its validity before opening of the polling station. STO has checked for traces of invisible ink after 2 hours since its application and found out that the special appliance did not reveal any traces on his finger arguably because the liquid was not valid. Procedural violations concerning inking safeguards have been revealed at # 68 EP of # 22 Marneuli ED, # 45 EP of # 11 Sagarejo ED, # 36 EP of # 23 Bolnisi ED (subject to frequent violations), # 40 EP of # 40 Akhalkalaki ED.

Numerous facts have been reported by the STOs where the voter used to enter into the voting booth together with another person allegedly because of his/her physical disability. In all cases such voters complained physical impairment and asked for support out of the voters present in the polling station. However, as reported by the STOs disability of the mentioned voters had not been visually distinguished giving a reasonable doubt that these have been actually the genuine facts of influencing the choice of voters. Such severe violations of secrecy of vote have been revealed at # 43 EP of # 24 Dmanisi ED, # 46 EP of # 23 Bolnisi ED, # 55 EP of # 23 Bolnisi ED, # 18 EP of # 23 Bolnisi ED, # 48 EP of # 11 Sagarejo ED. Therefore it can be concluded that in Kvemo Kartli region especially in Dmanisi and Bolnisi Electoral Districts the trend of entering of more than one person into the voting booths has carried systematic character.

STO has reported few cases where same person was trying to cast vote several times at # 45 EP of # 23 Bolnisi ED.

STOs reported some incidents of influencing the choice of voters in Kvemo Karli region densely populated by ethnic Azerbaijanian population. The voters present at the electoral precinct have been openly proclaiming "Besh-Besh" meaning 5 in Azerbaijanian languages which was simultaneously the assigned number of the "United National Movement".

One case has been noted by the STO where the Authority of the village was attempting to directly influence the voters to vote for the "United National Movement" (# 18 EP of Akhmeta ED).

Generally in all the electoral precincts observed the regulator of the number of voters inside the polling station has regulated the quantity of the people in order to avoid overcrowding of the station. Only a single case has been reported of overcrowd and mass.

In most cases the voting process with the movable ballot box has proceeded in accordance with the standing electoral rules and procedures. One case has been noted by the STOs when the integrity of the seal of the movable box has been damaged. However, PEC has not stopped the vote casting process and allowed the members of the commission to continue the administration of the voting process with the damaged seal mobile ballot box (# 9 EP of # 21 Gardabani ED). Moreover, there has been an incident where the ID numbers of the voters have not been included in the mobile ballot box voters' list.

Closing of the precinct and counting of votes

STOs have noted that all the voters in all EPs observed who stood in the queue by 20:00 have been given the possibility to vote. Moreover, no voters who came to the precinct after 20:00 have been granted the right to vote.

PMMG STOs did not identify any unauthorized people present at the electoral precincts after the closure of the precinct.

In general, despite some minor electoral shortcomings identified in many EPs observed the members of PECs have abided by the law-prescribed procedures of counting the votes. No instance has been reported where the authorized or unauthorized persons have tried to influence the ballot-counting process.

However, there have been some exceptions including the case in Gardabani ED where the PMMG STO has been expelled from the EP during vote counting.

11. Election day-related complaints and appeals

Given the facts and available evidence it appeared that the resent Parliamentary Elections in Georgia have been different in many ways as compared with the previous elections. The progress observed in the elections has been widely noted by both domestic and international observers. One of the findings of the present elections has been the improved professional quality (higher comprehension of electoral rules, procedures, rights and obligations of authorized persons including observers to be present at PEC, DEC and CEC) of the members of election administration which allowed a significant reduction in the number of cases with drastic violations of electoral law including the cases which would invoke wider public attention. Therefore, PMMG observers have not identified any facts of severe violations of electoral rules and procedures. However, some instances of procedural violations have been identified especially during an opening of electoral precincts and vote casting stage.

It has to be noted that according to the previously issued instructions observers have reacted to the violations including procedural shortcomings in two ways:

- I) Verbal objection expressed towards the PEC to correct or eradicate the problem immediately;
- II) Filing complaints and submitting to PEC and DEC in case the PEC has not immediately reacted to the verbal objections to eradicate or correct the problem.

Results of observers' performance monitoring have revealed some interesting trend: verbal objections raised by the observers have been satisfied (met) in most cases by the chairman or the members of PEC. Only few complaints have been filed as far as the PEC did not satisfy the verbal demand of the observers. Moreover, observers have been instructed by the project management to fill out the incident form in case of identification of the violation or shortcoming and thus pursue the legal means for the mitigation of the problem. In total PMMG observers have filled out 77 incident forms throughout the observation of elections. 74 incidents have been eradicated through raising verbal objections without the submission of complaints.

In total PMMG observers:

- Raised 77 Verbal objections and filled out respective number of incident forms;
- Filed and submitted 48 complaints to the respective electoral precincts (EP);
- Filed and submitted 9 appeals to the DEC

Moreover, PMMG lawyers they have filed and submitted 2 appeals to the Central Election Commission (CEC) as well as 4 appeals to the courts.

It has to be noted that most of the appeals and complaints filled by the observers as well as the lawyers responded to the following major types of electoral shortcomings: a) Attempts to influence the voting; b) Violation of the marking procedures; c) Some electoral shortcomings which have hindered preparatory and ballot-casting process; d) The shortage of ballot papers delivered at electoral precincts has been a systematic violation; e) More than one voter entering the election booth in has acquired systematic manner.

12. Recommendations

Based on the findings of 1 October Parliamentary Elections PMMG offers the following set of intersectoral recommendations for consideration to the state authorities, political parties and civil societal organizations in order to further carry out the respective efforts for the conduction of elections consistent to internationally established norms and standards for fair and democratic elections.

1. Improvement of the legal base:

- 1.1. There is a great need to reconsider the changes to the election system which should be based on broad consultations carried out among major stakeholders including political parties and civil societal organizations. It has to be reiterated that ED boundaries should be revised so that there is no big variation in numbers of registered voters between EDs in order to ensure the equality of the vote. Moreover, the electoral system should be constructed in a way that overall proportionality is safeguarded.
- 1.2. The newly elected Parliament of Georgia should develop and enact a new election code in order

to eradicate the mounting inconsistencies revealed during the present as well as in the past electoral periods. The new election code should be based on consensus and widely incorporate the recommendations developed by the local and international stakeholders.

- 1.3. The new election code should clearly stipulate the abuse of administrative resources and to this end prohibit the direct or indirect use of all types of administrative resources including financial, material, technical and human resources for campaigning purposes by political parties and public officials.
- 1.4. It is necessary to introduce new regulations to the election law in order to address the issue of political officials from combining campaigning activities with official duties and the blurred distinction between government initiatives with campaign activities. Moreover, the law should include the clear definitions of campaigning and vote buying.

2. Election Administration:

Despite some improvements in professional qualification of the members of election administration there is still greater need for comprehensive training of PEC members with special emphasis on procedural issues including counting and tabulation.

3. Electoral process:

For any forthcoming elections state authorities of Georgia should disseminate a clear message to all state servants that interference in the electoral process including pressure, intimidation, abuse of human rights, physical and verbal harassment, illegal surveillance, illegal dismissal from job and other respective breach of fundamental rights and freedoms against political activists, representatives of public and private sectors or voters is unacceptable and will not be tolerated. Moreover, any instances of violation of the law should be duly and impartially investigated.

4. Media

- 4.1. It has to be reiterated that state authorities as well as political parties should refrain from interfering in the works of media and journalists as far as it may undermine their independence.
- 4.2. The robust media monitoring entity needs to be set up which will be used for immediate identification of any impartial and inequitable news coverage of candidates and political parties and for undertaking of prompt corrective action to mitigate the problem.
- 4.3. State authorities should apply to any means to ensure the equal playground for all media means including the equal access to the media space.

5. Complaints and appeals:

5.1. There is a greater need to develop more simplified and clear complaints and appeals process

for challenging decision of election commissions and electoral violations. The procedures should capture a single appeal process, should have minimal technical obstacles and have clear remedies.

- 5.2. It has to be noted that timeframes for the submission of complaints and appeals should be further extended to provide enough opportunity for complaints to develop adequate arguments and prepare relevant evidence.
- 5.3. Central Election Commission of Georgia should develop detailed operating procedures for dealing with complaints and appeals at all levels of election administration ranging from registration to the issuance of decision. To this end DEC and CEC members and legal staff should be trained in the election law, adjudication skills and due process standards. Decisions and determination of complaints should be systematic addressing the facts, law and evidence in a legally sound and impartial manner.
- 5.4. Central Election Commission of Georgia should maintain a regularly updated database of all complaints and appeals submitted to the election administration with links to the decisions to be posted on its website.
- 5.5. The fee for the submission of election related cases to the court should be eliminated or kept to a minimum level so as not to deter stakeholders from the submission of complaints and appeals. The law should also permit voters to file complaints to election commissions and courts against all types of violations of election law.
- 5.6. There is a greater need for training for party and CSOs lawyers on election related law, investigating violations and collecting evidence, procedures for filling complaints and skills in drafting and presenting effective complaints.

6. Participation of national minorities:

The findings of 1 October Parliamentary Elections have clearly demonstrated the following problems and challenges ethnic minorities are coping with during electoral process: lack of electoral knowledge and skills, insufficient understanding of own electoral rights as well as political system, lack of perception of the programs of the political subjects, lack of clarity over the importance and the nature of electoral process. Correction of the problem requires comprehensive and consistent engagement of different stakeholders in minority regions to deliver adequate voters' educational programs. To this end:

- 6.1. Local civil societal organizations as well as international organizations and mass media should carry out wide-scale voter, civic and political education related programs for ethnic minority groups on a long-termed basis during the periods in between the elections;
- 6.2. **Educational establishments should** include elements of voters' education in the curricula of high grades of the secondary schools and high educational establishments in line with the promotion of non-formal educational and awareness raising events in the field among high school and university students;

- 6.3. **Election administration** to continue the practice of maintenance of the special working group on the vulnerable groups of the voters and enhance scale of its activities; further continue the training of PEC members with ethnic minority background;
- 6.4. **Political parties should** allocate additional efforts for the work with vulnerable groups in ethnic minority regions, educate voters about own programs and promote political dialogue at the local level.

13. Election results

Summary figures:

Number of voters: 3 613 851

Number of voters participating in the elections: 2 215 661

Number of ballot papers deemed invalid: 62 874

Number of votes received by election subjects:

#	Name of Party (Block)	Number of	%	Number
		received votes		of
				received
1	"V-11 V-1 F C"	5.065	0.27	mandates
1	"Kakha Kukava – Free Georgia"	5 865	0.27	
4	"National Democratic Party"	3 023	0.14	
5	"United National Movement – More Benefits to	867 432	40.34	33 prop.
	People"			32 maj.
9	"Justice for Georgia"	4 073	0.19	
10	"Giorgi Targamadze – Christian Democratic Union"	43 805	2.04	
17	"Public Movement"	546	0.03	
19	"Freedom – the Way of Zviad Gamsakhurdia"	1 013	0.05	
23	"Jondi Baghaturia – Georgian Group"	2 323	0.11	
24	"Political Union – New Rights"	9 255	0.43	
26	"People's Party"	527	0.02	
30	"Merab Kostava Society"	997	0.05	
35	"Future Georgia"	701	0.03	
36	"Labor Council of Georgia"	581	0.03	
38	"Shalva Natelashvili – Labor Party of Georgia"	26 621	1.24	
40	"Georgian Sportsmen's Community"	1 572	0.07	
41	"Bidzina Ivanishvili – Georgian Dream"	1 181 862	54.97	44 prop.
				41 maj.

Sources: CEC summary protocol and CEC website http://cesko.ge/files/2012/SUMMARY_
PROTOCOL 2012.pdf

14. About the PMMG

The Union Public Movement Multinational Georgia (PMMG) was registered as a non-governmental organization on June 1, 1999. PMMG unites citizens of Georgia representing different ethnic, religious, and linguistic groups residing in a country. It is an umbrella organization which provides resource support and cooperates with the representatives of more than 18 ethnic communities and 56 grass-root NGOs working in the field of protection of rights of ethnic, religious and linguistic groups residing in Georgia. PMMG is holding a status of the Partner Organization of Council of Europe. It represents interests of the "International Coalition Against Hate in the South Caucasus". It is member of the Federal Union of European Nationalities and Minorities of Europe.

Since 2005 PMMG has been engaged in Kkakheti, Kvemo Kartli and Samtskhe Javakheti regions through the conduction of elections observation programs. Findings and recommendations delivered by PMMG have been regularly disseminated among different stakeholders, including the CEC. The policy recommendations in relation to the electoral environment developed by the organization have in many cases been considered and taken into account by the respective stakeholders – international and domestic organizations.

The main directions of the PMMG activities are: Promotion, protection of rights and development of potential of the vulnerable groups, first of all ethnic, religious and linguistic minorities and creation of conditions for their active participation at the all levels; Transformation of conflicts, establishment of peace and civil accord; Monitoring of human rights standards and protection of the human rights defenders; Democratic transformations and European values; Local self government and development of local communities; Development of the intercultural dialogue and exchange, in line with harmonization of the interethnic relations in the society; Voters' education, elections observation and promotion of vulnerable groups effective political, civic and electoral participation.

More information is available on the PMMG website: http://pmmg.org.ge